

MINUTES OF COUNCIL MEETING
January 24, 2017

The Regular Meeting of City Council was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with Mayor Domenick Mucci presiding. The meeting was opened with a silent prayer followed by the Pledge of Allegiance. Present were Councilmen DiLoreto, Dressel, Hahn, Johnson, Paul, Timmons and Villamagna.

Also present; Law Director Gary Repella, Finance Director Dave Lewis, Health Commissioner Nicole Runco, Dave Gossett from the Herald Star and WTOV9.

APPROVAL/CORRECTION OF MINUTES

Mrs. Hahn moved that the minutes of January 17, 2017 be accepted as written. Second by Mr. Johnson. Roll call. All ayes. So moved minutes accepted declared Mayor Mucci.

PETITIONS/COMMUNICATIONS

The Clerk read a letter from the Ohio Division of Liquor Control regarding the transfer of a liquor license at Hu Nan Restaurant.

Mr. Dressel moved that the correspondence be accepted and forwarded to the appropriate departments. Second by Mr. DiLoreto. Roll call. All ayes. So moved declared Mayor Mucci.

ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS

NO. 2017-1 – BY COUNCIL AS A WHOLE – 3rd reading

ORDINANCE TO APPROVE AND ADOPT CURRENT REPLACEMENT PAGES TO THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the third and final reading of Ordinance No. 2017-1. If there is anyone wishing to speak on Ordinance No. 2017-1 please come forward and state your name and address.”

Mr. Paul called question. Roll call. All ayes. Ordinance No. 2017-1 duly adopted declared Mayor Mucci.

NO. 2017-2 – BY THE SERVICE COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. DiLoreto, Johnson, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE LINCOLN BLVD GUARDRAIL REPLACEMENT PROJECT, CITY PROJECT NO. 2016-125 AND COMPLETE ALL NECESSARY FUNCTIONS THAT MAY BE REQUIRED TO COMPLETE SAID PROJECT, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ENGINEERING DESIGN SERVICES, RIGHT OF WAY SERVICES INCLUDING ACQUISITION OF RIGHT OF WAY, UTILITY RELOCATION, CONSTRUCTION ADMINISTRATION/INSPECTION SERVICES, BIDDING SERVICES, ADVERTISING FOR BIDS FOR CONSTRUCTION, SUBJECT TO THE RIGHT TO REJECT ANY AND ALL BIDS AND REBIDDING THAT MAY BE REQUIRED, AUTHORIZING THE ENTERING INTO SAID CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST AND MOST QUALIFIED BIDDER, AUTHORIZING PAYMENT THEREFORE AND TO EXECUTE CONTRACTS AS REQUIRED.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-2. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-3 – BY THE SERVICE COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. DiLoreto, Johnson, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE 2017 CITY STREET HOT-MIX RESURFACING IMPROVEMENTS, CITY PROJECT NO. 2017-100, SUBJECT TO THE RIGHT TO REJECT ANY AND ALL BIDS AND REBIDDING THAT MAY BE REQUIRED, AUTHORIZING THE ENTERING INTO SAID CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST AND MOST QUALIFIED BIDDER, AUTHORIZING PAYMENT THEREFORE AND TO EXECUTE CONTRACT AS REQUIRED.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-3. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-4 – BY THE SERVICE COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. DiLoreto, Johnson, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE 2017 CITY PAVEMENT MARKING PROGRAM, CITY PROJECT NO. 2017-102, SUBJECT TO THE RIGHT TO REJECT ANY AND ALL BIDS AND REBIDDING THAT MAY BE REQUIRED, AUTHORIZING THE ENTERING INTO SAID CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST AND MOST QUALIFIED BIDDER, AUTHORIZING PAYMENT THEREFORE AND TO EXECUTE CONTRACT AS REQUIRED.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-4. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-5 – BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. Johnson, Dressel, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE A HOUSING REVOLVING LOAN FUND ADMINISTRATION AGREEMENT WITH THE STATE OF OHIO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES AGENCY.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-5. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-6 – BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. Johnson, Dressel, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER AND URBAN PROJECTS DIRECTOR TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE 2017 CDBG STREET IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM, SUBJECT TO THE RIGHT TO REJECT ANY AND ALL BIDS, AUTHORIZING ENTERING INTO SAID CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST AND MOST QUALIFIED BIDDER AND AUTHORIZING PAYMENT THEREOF.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-6. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-7 – BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. Johnson, Dressel, Hahn

ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER AND URBAN PROJECTS DIRECTOR TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE 2017 MARTIN LUTHER KING JR. RECREATION CENTER HVAC SYSTEM PROJECT, SUBJECT TO THE RIGHT TO REJECT ANY AND ALL BIDS, AUTHORIZING ENTERING INTO SAID CONTRACT WITH THE LOWEST AND MOST QUALIFIED BIDDER AUTHORIZING PAYMENT THEREOF.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-7. The third and final reading will be January 31st.”

NO. 2017-8 – BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE – 2nd reading

Messrs. Johnson, Dressel, Hahn

ORDINANCE AMENDING CHAPTER 1175 OF THE ZONING CODE CREATING THE STARKDALE ROAD NEIGHBORHOOD CONSERVATION DISTRICT.

Mayor Mucci – “You have heard the second reading of Ordinance No. 2017-8. The third and final reading will be March 7th; however, there will be a public hearing by the Planning Commission on March 6th at 7:00 p.m. in Council Chambers.”

REPORT OF COMMITTEES

Mr. DiLoreto – no report

Mr. Dressel – no report

Mrs. Hahn – no report

Mr. Johnson – gave a reminder of next week’s Planning Committee meeting at 6:00 p.m.

Mr. Paul – Mr. Paul introduced Dr. Pat Macedonia from the Health Board to give statements about the Health Department.

Dr. Macedonia – “Thank you, Mr. Paul. I don’t want this to be confrontational but I think it’s for the last time hopefully we can clear the air on the process of getting to what everybody wants, including our Board of Health; a union of these two departments, the County and the City. In spite of some comments and criticisms especially those that were at our last meeting or your last meeting; I received the minutes of that meeting and everybody’s new term now is fact checking; I’m going to do some fact checking for all of you. So I assume that all of you got this information either via email so I assume you had time to review this. But I did receive an email from Mr. Villamagna this afternoon stating that ‘I stand by the statements that I made at the Council meeting as fact. I hope this much effort is going toward a union as there is in trying to block it.’ We as a Department of Health are very offended by this whatever this is Mr. Villamagna has about blocking this union. We are not blocking anything and I will prove to you fact that we haven’t been. But the process again, I want to explain to you again; we all received this feasibility study; the process was to review the study and then take it back to the District Advisory Council. They are to the Board as City Council you are to us; the District Advisory Council is their bosses, the Jefferson County Health Department. So back in October, we informed all of you we can’t do anything until we understand what the District Advisory Council is going to do to recommend to their Board, the County Health Department; what they want. They voted not to form a union; a union again is a consolidation of both the departments in to one. They at that time decided, no; we don’t want a union; we’re very willing to look into contracting different services; that is the process. So we then met sometime in November with Mr. Mavromatis, Mr. Repella, myself, our Health Commissioner Nicole, Bruce Misselwicz, Dr. Petrola; at that time we discussed how we wanted to proceed. The discussion at that time was we gave them all the services that we provide in the City and bring us back a contract that we can review. The question you asked Mr. Mavromatis last week, Mr. Villamagna; what has been done since that first meeting. We were told then you will not hear from us until March. There is nothing we can do, there is nothing your City

Manager can do to speed this process up; that is the process. So when you asked the question what have we done; granted, we haven't done anything but behind the scenes we have talked about contracts, the union; the union discussion is out of our hands. If the DAC says we don't want it, we can't do anything as a City Health Department. So, fact #1; you Mr. Villamagna said there is no record; you went to the County Health Department and you must've asked if the City Health Department ever corresponded with you about consolidating services and you were told no. Well, the truth of the matter is; and I think you have it in your packet; on November 29, 2012 we the Steubenville Health Department did send a letter to the County Health Department; Bruce Misselwicz did in his newspaper article confirm the fact that he did receive a letter. We then on February 13, 2013 said to Cathy Davison, then the City Manager; nobody responded to us about consolidation, about not duplicating services; so the fact is we did do that; in spite of what you were told it is documented that we did have that meeting. So fact #1, unfortunately; you were wrong. Now you said you're going to stand by what you said and I don't know what else to tell you but your facts are wrong."

Mr. Villamagna – "Do you want me to answer that?"

Dr. Macedonia – "Not yet. #2; in your comments to Council; you said the City spent \$300,000; in reality last year you only spent \$198,000. I have the financial report here. This whole thing about we tried to keep Mr. Mavromatis out of all these meetings; I'm not sure where you're getting that information. He's been invited and has come to every meeting we've had; so this whole thing about we've bullied or I forget the word you used; you said we weren't going to do this; that's totally inaccurate. Mr. Mavromatis has been at every meeting we've had with the Board of Health. We talked about the County Department; he spoke to Bruce I don't know how many times about this whole process; so this whole idea; we're not trying to stop anything. I hope we can just resolve this and put it to rest and let the process take. Your third comment was about all these facts about County health departments; everybody has done it but us and Youngstown; well, that's not accurate either. So if you read your fact finding that we sent to you; there have been health departments in the State that have not merged; have not formed a union. The process has been since we started this and we've been told by our consultants that contractual services is the way to go; we will eventually get to that union; we know we will. But no county by their consulting recommendations is going to go to a union; it just doesn't work that way; you have to learn to live with each other; learn what the services are you have and you don't have. I made a comment in the paper we're going to lose services; you said that's not a fact; that is a fact because right now the County doesn't do some things that we do in the City. I said may; I didn't say will; if they don't agree to provide these services to the citizens then somebody has to provide that services because they're mandated by the State. I don't want to go through details of what service they are and what they aren't but there are services potentially that we could lose. So these are the facts and I appreciate all this and that your response was not put in the newspaper because I think it would've incited a lot more people than just the Board of Health. I think Dave was pretty nice to you by not printing some of these comments. But if you're going to criticize somebody in our department; be factual."

Mr. Villamagna – "Oh I am going to be factual; when you're done I will be factual."

Dr. Macedonia – "With that being said; all we're asking; I'm here representing the Health Department; let this process take place; you're not only bothering the Health Department in the City; you're also disturbing the County department because they read the papers too. So if you want to get this thing done; let the process take its place and hopefully in March Mr. Mavromatis will have some information from the County that will be reviewed by your Council. Now, to understand this process; contractual services are between the two Boards; not City Council. But trust me; we will present this to you; if it's going to cost somebody money; we're not going to hide anything; the way the process works is through the two health departments. If you're going to merge or form a union then you're right; it goes through City Council and the City Manager and maybe the attorney; I'm not positive who the other people are. In our current process now it is between the two departments. But trust me; we are not going to make any decisions until it comes back to you because there is going to be money that needs to be spent. So that is the process we're trying to follow; we're hoping and I do believe the majority of Council members do understand it; unfortunately Mr. Villamagna did not understand it. I'm finished and I'd be happy to answer any of your questions."

Mr. Villamagna – "First off; I don't know how kind Dave was being to me by not putting what I said in the paper because what I said was fact. I answered four things; the first thing that you put in the paper is you said that the Health Board sat back for a year and took a lot of criticism but all the talk of consolidation and union between the City and County Health Department actually started a couple years ago under Commissioner Patti Reda. She sent a letter to the County Health Board asking about the duplication of services; City Health Board felt there were improvements that could be made but never received. I wasn't here in 2012; I was aware that there was some talk about contracting out of Pasquarella; we were talking about a full merger; and I do understand the difference between a full merger and contracting out. Mr. Villamagna also understands that there is a cost involved to do this; just to clear those points up right there."

Dr. Macedonia – "Do you want me to read you the letter we sent?"

Mr. Villamagna – "No. Here is what I said; I said when this was brought up in 2014 about consolidation, not one person said anything about trying to consolidate anything. I personally went to the County Health Board where Dave Gossett was taking what he's doing right now and I said has the City been up here with any meetings and I was told no; that's what I was referring to. I don't know what you did in 2012 in all honesty. That's what I was referring to; but when people don't communicate; me and you have been friends a long time and you could've called and asked me what I meant when I said this stuff. Number two; Council members feel there will not be an additional cost; I'm not going to read that whole thing that's the summation of what you said; Council does understand that there is going to be cost; we do not know if it's going to be an additional cost

and that's what we want to know; that's what we're looking to know; we want to know if there is going to be cost. With that being said; what we're spending now in tax dollars which is the taxpayers money; we're spending more for our Health Department per person if we were going to break it down to each person paying; than the County Health Department is paying on their millage. But I know there is going to be a cost. Council never said it wasn't going to cost anything; Council feels negotiations with the County will be fruitful. We the City of Steubenville already subsidize the City Health Department to the tune of around \$300,000 of taxpayer money. The \$40,000 brought in by private insurance is not close to what we need to keep it running; because I got a call and he said are you making money on that Health Department and I said no we're not; that is one separate thing is our private insurance; that's what my reference was there. Four; our Board of Health will negotiate a union between the two departments with the County Board of Health with the assistance of City Manager Jim Mavromatis. I didn't comment on the rest of this but I will comment now about it; we're appreciative of Nicole and her staff; we're continuing to maintain the same services for our residents and the workload is drastically increased; we are also appreciative of the hard work that is being done over there but what I said was; our Board of Health will negotiate the union of the two departments with the help of the City Manager Jim Mavromatis; the Board fought tooth and nail to keep Jim Mavromatis from being part of it. Where I got that from is we sat here in a public hearing with the Board of Health on one side and us on this side; and it was adamant that Jim Mavromatis was not going to sit in on those meetings because he had no place in there with the Health Department and we said we were adamant that he was going to sit in there so with that being said we had to pass a resolution 2016-71 authorizing the City Manager to be in the negotiations with you guys; that's why I said we had to fight tooth and nail because we did; we had a pretty good meeting with the Health Board over there and us over here. The last thing I said was to the citizens of Steubenville; it has worked every place else and I have a list here; I don't want to go into a lot of details but I do have a list; and I'm not saying a full merger or a union contracts but it has worked every place else and I have a complete list here of places where it did work in Ohio except Youngstown; and the Youngstown Vindicator or the other paper; front page; stupid, ignorant not to do it; they criticized heavily. In 2013 we subsidized the Health Department \$265,486; that's not my figures, that's coming from the City; in 2014 we subsidized \$346,000; in 2015 we subsidized \$303,633; first ten months of 2016 we subsidized \$208,374; I didn't come up with those figures, I got them from the Finance office; so that's where I got them from. Now, the fact thing; again, Pat; me and you know each other as personal friends; you know what I think about you; you could've called me instead of us having this debate back and forth in the newspaper because I would be more than willing to sit down with you and discuss it. My personality isn't going to let the Herald Star say something and me not answer it; I'm not the most educated guy in the world but I'm far from the dumbest and I understand all these things that are being brought up; but when all the fighting was done because Jim Mavromatis wasn't wanted in that meeting; that put my antennas up; why don't they want to do it; I don't understand. And how many meetings have there been; there have only been like two or three meetings. If this has been going on since 2012; and I don't want to say because I don't know what happened there so I don't want to get into that; but it's been going on since 2014 because it was one of the first things I brought up when I was here; we went from a city that was 40,000 down to 17,000; we can't do this; you sat in here with the Finance; by 2021 we're going to be in trouble if we don't do something. And I'm not going to sit here as a Councilman and be the Councilman that ran this city into the ground. I'm going to try to the best of my ability to make these finances work for the City without going to these people and that was my last thing. My last statement that I made publicly; and I was a little bit disappointed in Dave, I didn't realize he was being nice to me I thought he was being mean to me; I along with this Council will do everything possible to provide good services to the citizens of this town and to watch the taxpayer money like it's my own. Now, those are my facts and that's why I told you I stand by what I said; because I don't; I'm smart enough to look up what I'm going to say without just blurting these things out; I got them from the Finance Department and that's all I can tell you, Pat. But my intentions are not to sit here and argue with you back and forth in the paper; I don't like doing that. I want to see it go forward. And I understand; I understand all this stuff. I didn't come to understand it in two minutes; I had to go over all this more than once and I had to talk with other people who explained things to me; but I understand how it's going to take time. But I just feel that it's not moving the way it should; now, I understand Bruce had a health problem. It took less than two months to negotiate the contract with Toronto; less than two months. Now we need three years, four years, five years; to do this. I just don't see it and if I'm wrong I apologize; I think that it can be done shorter than what we're dragging this out to be. That's all I can tell you and anything you want to ask me I'll answer."

Dr. Macedonia – "Bob, first of all; the County; you can't compare the Toronto contract with the City; did it happen in two months; it probably did; but the complexity of that contract compared to ours is so much more complex; there are many more services that have to be provided; it's not going to happen in two months. Now you extended it to four or five years; nobody said that; we're saying two years. Now; we presented to you a budget in December; we cut our budget by \$158,000; we're on the same page you're on; we realize the City needs our help so what we did through Nicole's efforts is we reduced our time; not services; but by \$158,000; am I right Nicole?"

Nicole Runco – "\$145,000."

Dr. Macedonia – "So we're on the same page; and we're on the same page even how you're talking to me about getting to this union; getting to one viable health department; we're all trying to work the same effort but we're being hurdled and criticized and I don't want to repeat myself again. Here is the financial report that I just got this morning from the City; it shows you supported us \$198,000; this is the City's information, this isn't mine."

Mr. Villamagna – "I have the same report."

Dr. Macedonia – “I don’t know what number you’re reading but; anyway, that’s what we were given this morning.”

Mr. Villamagna – “You did say to me there was \$300,000 in 2014.”

Dr. Macedonia – “You said that.”

Mr. Villamagna – “You shook your head yes.”

Dr. Macedonia – “I meant no; oh, in 2014 maybe, I don’t know those numbers but in 2016.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I did say the right facts.”

Dr. Macedonia – “This year I’m talking about.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I’m not talking about that; I’m talking about as an average of \$300,000.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Anyway; my goal is as the health department is this process is in order; we can’t speed the County up; I’ve said this more than once; I said it during our meetings. Any of you are invited to our meetings; they’re not closed; Bob, you’re not very good at our attendance so if you were there every time you’d hear what we do.”

Mr. Villamagna – “Let me tell you why I’m not good at your attendance, Pat; because when I come there I’m getting tired of being told how stupid I really am; that I don’t understand what’s going on; I’ve been around, I’m street wise; I know what is going on and I know when I’m sitting in that meeting that was going to be an ambush Thursday about what I said in this Herald Star. I am not getting ambushed; I want it to be done in this room where the news media is here because I’m not going to argue with you but when you have the executive session and I’m asked to leave that’s a whole different story; but I’m good at coming to the meetings; I went to every one of them until this all started because I’m not going to sit there and listen to that every Thursday or once a month; I’m sorry, I just am not going to do it. But what I said I brought up because you said something to the press. I didn’t search out Dave Gossett and say I want you to respond; and I didn’t call News9 and ask News9 to put my response on. I thought it was done.”

Dr. Macedonia – “We felt obligated for that article in the paper; obligated to the citizens of this community for them to understand the changes that the Health Department are going to make; that was the purpose of that; not to badger you or anybody else on City Council; it was to inform the citizens which we have a responsibility to do just like all of you do. If anything in there isn’t factual that I said then show me. I have a lot of things that you said that aren’t factual.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I disagree with you.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Bob, it’s in writing; I’m not going to argue with you; it’s black and white; I’m not going to argue with you.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I have it in black and white here, Pat.”

Dr. Macedonia – “This doesn’t need to go to this; all we’re asking is be patient with us; it’s happening; Mr. Mavromatis is totally involved in this process; the County is where it’s at now we’re waiting for a contract to come back; you all will see it out of respect for City Council.”

Mr. Villamagna – “That’s all I want.”

Dr. Macedonia – “That’s been the process all along.”

Mr. Villamagna – “It wasn’t a clear thing with me, Pat.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Ok, well; is it clear now?”

Mr. Villamagna – “Yes, I hope it is.”

Mrs. Hahn – “I have a couple questions if it’s ok; you said that the State mandates some services that we provide that the County doesn’t; how do they do an end round a State mandate?”

Dr. Macedonia – “What happens is; and I want to respond to Bob; why our per capita is much higher than the County’s; we do over and above what is recommended and what is required. I’ll give you a couple examples; the pool inspection we do twice a year; the County doesn’t do that; we do nuisance complaints, the County doesn’t do that; our food service; we’re more strict than the County is; so those are the differences; there is a minimum standard that the State requires; we at the City are above that minimum standard and we feel it is protecting our citizens; to protect the pool; we do school inspections; there are a lot more things that we do; we used to do day care centers; so again, the County doesn’t do that. So those are things we’re concerned about. Nuisance by dog bites; we’re concerned whether or not the County will do those things; we don’t know that yet. In that feasibility study there were two pages; the things that we did and the things that the County did; so at that meeting that I referenced in October, we said to the County; here is what we do, bring us a contract back with what it is going to cost us for you to provide these services. That is the difference in how they do things and we do things. They’re ok what they do; we’re just over and above the standard.”

Mrs. Hahn – “I’m a little confused; because you said the State mandates services; you’re actually describing more like we do more than what the State requires.”

Dr. Macedonia – “The State mandates that the City provide healthcare services to the City; by doing so there are four personnel people they require; the Health Commissioner, a Medical Director, a Nurse and an Environmental Director. So when the State comes in here if you all decide to disband the Health Department; if the County doesn’t want to do it the State is going to say to you this is what you’re going to have to do but guess what; here is the bill that you’re going to have to pay for those services; you can’t get away without any public health services; the State revised code requires every city or municipality, I’m not sure what the districts are; requires public health.”

Mrs. Hahn – “Ok. And the other question; did the District Advisory Council give you reasons why they rejected the idea of consolidation?”

Dr. Macedonia – “They did; I’m not sure of the structure, maybe the Mayor can better explain a bit of it; their inside millage that they require people to pay will increase based on the services if we form a union; because

when you form a union there are going to be more personnel that they need, more services they provide; I'm not sure how all this works, the Mayor can explain it better than I can; but it's going to increase the citizens, the townships tax; is it tax or what is it?"

Mayor Mucci – "It is an inner millage."

Mr. Dressel – "But wouldn't that actually just impact the City residents who aren't paying that today and would have to pay the same amount that the other residents are paying in the future; that's what we were told originally. So why would there be a difference?"

Dr. Macedonia – "I can't explain that."

Mr. Dressel – "We don't know there is a difference but we're assuming there is a difference."

Dr. Macedonia – "They must think there is one; that's what it is."

Mr. Dressel – "If they're taxing at a certain millage today; and I don't mean to be confrontational here; if you're taxing at a certain amount today and you're providing those services to every other citizen in the County, every single one of them; and then we add the 17 or 18,000 people that we have in Steubenville that will be taxed at the same exact amount because they're going to get the same exact services; there is absolutely no reason on the face of this earth that should be a different amount of money unless they change something in what they're offering because quite honestly the rate at which these services are used is so minimal the amount of impact is just; there is no reason for it to be different. If it's different it's because of something other than a merger or those taxes should be already different out there than what they are today. Just because you're adding more people; let's say that 16,000 people moved in to the County; not in Steubenville; then the taxes would just be applied again as they would under real estate taxes or whatever they're doing today at the same millage it currently is now; nothing would change. So adding 16,000 people here that are one or two blocks from the current location of the Health Department, that doesn't make any sense that it would be different. So that argument; sorry, even I'm not buying it. Everything else I buy."

Dr. Macedonia – "I can't speak for that."

Mr. Dressel – "Well, but then they need to respond as to why they that is different with far more detail because there is absolutely no reason you're going to change the tax bases just because you're adding more people; 16,000 people could move in to the County; that doesn't change the way the millage is working; it's just the volume. I understand, you can't answer it; but that's not a good reason."

Dr. Macedonia – "I just want to correct you on your comment; there are quite a bit of services the Health Department provides unbeknownst to a lot of people."

Mr. Dressel – "And I get all that; I'm just saying."

Dr. Macedonia – "You said there weren't that many services."

Mr. Dressel – "No; well, it's not ridiculously busy; but the point is if they were to merge there is no reason for the other people in the County's taxes to be going up because the people in Steubenville will pay those taxes. Today they're paying what is it; \$20 some dollars a year per person; and the County residents are paying \$4 or \$6?"

Mr. Johnson – "The City average is \$16 per person on tax dollars; the County averages \$4.66."

Dr. Macedonia – "Again, that is because of different services."

Mr. Dressel – "And you know what; I'm fine with those services; so that's my point of view on it."

Dr. Macedonia – "As far as your question if it's a question; I don't have an answer."

Mr. Dressel – "That's not; they should answer that then because if adding Steubenville will tax the entire County we should know why because that's not a rational taxation argument because you would be adding the City to that tax base to generate that revenue from the residents of the City; which would actually cost the City residents less than what they're paying today in the general tax."

Dr. Macedonia – "What I'd like to respond to is that; that's the way they operate. We operate a certain way in the City; they operate that way in the County; the District Advisory Council is their boss I guess you might want to say. We've talked to them but that was their decision."

Mayor Mucci – "I could get into some more details but there are several; Mr. DiLoreto wanted to go."

Mr. Johnson – "He's deferring to me first; I have a question for you. They're going to come back in March and give us what it's going to cost for the services that the City currently offers. Couldn't we also get them to give us a cost of what it would cost for them to just maintain the services that they offer to the rest of the County residents so we can have two things to compare; one, if they do exactly what we're doing it would cost us this; if they do exactly what they're doing for everybody else in the County, all the other County residents, it would cost us this. I think that would benefit all of us if we had something like that to compare."

Dr. Macedonia – "It's a good suggestion and I would ask Mr. Mavromatis to make that call to them."

Mayor Mucci – "They're doing that analysis."

Dr. Macedonia – "I think that's the way they're coming with it but we'll make sure."

Mr. Johnson – "The only other thing for a point of clarification; if we do a complete contracting out of our services then the Board doesn't have the authority to enter into a contract; the City Board doesn't; it is entered into by the City Manager with the majority of Council."

Dr. Macedonia – "Are you talking about a union?"

Mr. Johnson – "I'm talking about a complete contracting out."

Dr. Macedonia – "Let's correct our terms; union dissolves the Health Department."

Mr. Johnson – "I'm talking about a complete contracting out of our services."

Dr. Macedonia – "That's Health Department-Health Department."

Mr. Johnson – "No, no, no; look at the law."

Dr. Macedonia – "I did; I wouldn't come here if I didn't know the law."

Mr. Johnson – “3709.08; Bob has a copy of it and we can read it to you.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Please do.”

Mayor Mucci – “You have to look at health districts and health departments.”

Mr. Johnson – “You absolutely do; and I can guarantee that if it’s a full contracting out it is approved by the City Manager with the majority of Council; it is not a health department. If you’re going to do certain services and keep some to yourself then it’s a health board to health board; absolutely.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Let’s clarify the term; you’re speaking of a union.”

Mr. Johnson – “No, no, no, no; a union is there is one district, that’s it; a contracting out is there is two districts; a contracting out is what is happening in Toronto; Toronto contracted out their whole health department; Toronto still is a health district but they contracted out all their services and that contract had to be entered into by the Mayor of Toronto with the approval of Council; not the health board of Toronto. Similarly if we do a complete contracting out that contract is signed by Jim Mavromatis with the majority consent of Council; not with our health board. Now, if you want to keep say a nurse and contract out everything else; you guys can do that without City Council; but if you contract everything out and that’s what we want to go to because that’s the quickest and ultimately everybody I believe wants to do the union down the road; a complete contracting out means Jim Mavromatis signs the contract on the approval of Council and that’s why we wanted Jim in there because if we’re the ones that have to execute the contract which the Ohio Revised Code says we are; that’s why we want Jim in there; that’s the reason.”

Dr. Macedonia – “We don’t have a problem with that; and if that’s what the rule says; we’re all for it.”

Mr. Johnson – “That’s what the rule says.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Will you please read it?”

Mr. Villamagna – “3709.08; contract between boards of health; If the contract is with a city constituting a city health district, the chief executive of that city, with the approval of the majority of the members of the legislative authority of that city, approves the contract. A contract entered into under division (A) of this section that is for not all but for only one or some public health services provided by a board of health or the authority having the duties of a board of health shall neither require a determination by the director of health described in division (C)(1) of this section nor an approval by the persons described in division (C)(2)(a), (b), or (c), as applicable, to be effective; which is what I just read to you.”

Dr. Macedonia – “If you’re forming a health district; that’s the difference.”

Mr. Johnson – “What he just read is if you contract all the services out, that contract is signed by the City Manager with the approval of Council, not the Health Board.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Mr. Johnson; if that’s the way it is, we’re fine with it.”

Mr. Johnson – “That is the way it is.”

Dr. Macedonia – “That is your interpretation; we have a different one. If your City attorney feels it is one way because actually there is a statement in there by your City attorney how it is supposed to work; it’s in our minutes. But, again; listen, if that’s the way it needs to be, it’ll be that way. We just want clarification; we want to do it right; we don’t want to be criticized as I’m sure you don’t by someone down the road saying we did it the wrong way. If this is the way it’s going to be or needs to be, it’ll be.”

Mr. Johnson – “I agree; that’s why I’m clarifying it; that’s what the law says.”

Dr. Macedonia – “I’d like to have an interpretation; just so we’re clear.”

Mr. Johnson – “That’s fine; Gary will give you one.”

Dr. Macedonia – “No problem; we’re ok with that.”

Mr. DiLoreto – “I’d just like to make a statement here, that’s all. Sometimes I think I’m on who’s on first; all I want to do is just do what’s good for the citizens and their best interest; some of these issues can be done behind closed doors, these negotiations; and let’s get this city working again with the county; this is the first time since I’ve been on council in the last ten years that we’re at least working together, the city and the county; I think we’re on the right step; everybody has a vested interest; so as Admiral Farragut said; damn the torpedoes, full speed ahead.”

Mayor Mucci – “Thank you, Dr. Macedonia for attending this evening. As President of the Health Board I’m going to reserve some of my comments because I’m sure this discussion will come later on; but Mr. Villamagna you make a point and I just want to reiterate that point; healthcare services that we’re going to provide to our community do not come free; I think we all agree that there is a price tag. Now, where is that going to come from; obviously the users and our citizens; we have when we expend dollars from our general fund for the operation of the health department that is taxpayers money from the general fund which is our wage tax; so the working people in our community are paying to help give healthcare services to our citizens. So there is a cost and that cost was reduced I believe to \$138,000 the general fund subsidized the health department; because we do generate fees and we get reimbursed from insurance carriers and all for the operation of the health department which is over \$500,000 annually; so that is not a bad return so far. But remember as we move through there and that’s why we applied for a feasibility study and Kent State conducted it and we’re getting all these recommendations and advice from other either health departments, health districts or the professionals in the field so we can make a right decision; there has never been since 2012, 2014, 2015, 2016; no opposition to look at the services that are being provided and if they’re duplicate services to some way or another; until we did the feasibility study we didn’t have a clear picture on how to make that approach. Yes, starting in 2012 under Patti Reda with these discussions to date is a hell of a long time; I’d be the first to agree. But moving through that process to get the end run is where our difficulty came in; now we’re getting that road map of how to construct that is extremely important because we don’t want to put the burden strictly on the users or our residents because if we go with a union I’m a firm believer and I’ve been close to this; it will cost us more than what we are subsidizing. And remember if we

go and we go to a real estate, an inner millage like the County; our residents, our property owners in the City of Steubenville will be paying on their real estate taxes just like the County residents are paying. If that happens we're not reducing our 2% wage tax; we're still collecting that; we're going to move that money and maybe rightfully so into other areas; if it's police protection, safety forces, fire department, street paving, or whatever; we're going to be moving that 2% wage tax that is subsidizing the health department into other areas but we're going to put an additional burden on our property owners, our citizens, by increasing their real estate taxes. So, remember; it's not free; it's going to pay; our idea for the Steubenville Health Department is what is to provide, which is important; healthcare services to our citizens; I think we all agree that is important; but to provide it in an efficient manor without putting a large burden on the taxpayers. We could've very easily said let's do a union; let's combine with the County; let it be an inner millage where our residents will pay through the real estate taxes; but we're not reducing the wage tax; we're not looking at anything else; they'll be paying ultimately more than what the County is paying because we're still collecting that wage tax; so understand, there is a formula there; we're going to get to providing healthcare services to our city at an affordable cost to our residents."

Mr. Villamagna – "I don't know how much more clear I can make this; I understand completely that there is a cost here; this paper says in 2015 we gave the health department \$303,633.50; in 2016 we gave them \$208,374.95. And that money came from right here."

Mayor Mucci – "Yes but how much did the Health Department generate to offset that though?"

Mr. Dressel – "That's after the revenue."

Mr. Villamagna – "That's after."

Mr. Johnson – "That's after, Dom."

Mayor Mucci – "No, No; that is what the subsidy from the general fund was; what did the Health Department generate?"

Mr. Villamagna – "This is after they generated the money. We're not making money with the Health Department; you don't want to say that."

Mayor Mucci – "Absolutely not."

Mr. Villamagna – "This is what we subsidized after whatever they brought in; and they're taking away the vital statistics; but the whole point of it is unless somebody else in here; we know it's going to cost money; it's costing us now; it's costing us more per capita if we break this down into what we're spending than what it's costing the County residents now. And that being said; you know the services; I hear about these services and stuff; swimming pool; we do the swimming pool twice; we have one pool we're thinking about maybe closing; we have one pool to service; well, the Country Club, I don't know if we do it or not; but that being said; we're talking about taxpayer money out here and the Fire Department don't want to lose nobody; Police Department don't want to lose nobody; Health Department don't want to lose nobody; we have to pay. All my calls come from people that have potholes, weeds; nobody calls me and says I went down the Health Department and I had to wait in line because there was; and don't get me wrong when I say what I'm going to say here; I'm for health and I'm for children; we take care of more people sometimes in some of these areas and the only reason I'm bringing that up; that's the first one; we gave out more child immunizations to County residents than City residents. Our adult was; we gave out more to City but only by 30 or 60 I have to get a magnifying glass because I can't see this; but we're not; I want to give the same services; but I don't want to service Toronto and I don't want to service Weirton and I don't want to service Mingo; I want the County to service them. And I believe that we have to do something to get these costs in check and the only way we can do it; the citizens are going to have to pay; I don't care how you cut this or look at it; they're going to pay something; everybody out there, you think they aren't going to pay anything; no; they're going to pay something; keep it at a minimal; we don't know what the cost is going to be and you say I guarantee you; well I hope you're wrong and if you are I'll say Dom you're pretty smart because we don't know; is it going to cost us more; by the time we get done negotiating this we might be defunct anyway but we got to look at it; and I'm responsible; we, I'm talking for myself though, this is my feeling; I have to balance everything; I have to balance police, firemen, health, streets, everything. That's the intent here. I understand that it's going to cost us money; it's going to cost taxpayers money; the same way it's costing them now; is it going to be more, is it going to be less; we'll have to wait and see. But I understand and I think everybody in this room understands that it's going to cost the citizens money and it's coming out of the general fund which is their bank account; it doesn't belong to us."

Mayor Mucci – "My point was we'll be taking it still out of the general fund but there will still be an increase on their real estate taxes and we have a lot of fixed income."

Mr. Villamagna – "Maybe not, Dom; if we pay and I'm just going to throw a figure out because when I do this everybody says oh he should've never said that figure; but let's just say for the sake of argument to make it silly so nobody will think I'm serious; we're going to charge you \$500 to contract all these services; well then we'll just write them a check from the general fund and we'll pay the County for the contract for the \$500 instead of; now, is it going to be \$400,000; I don't know. Those are things you'll never hear from me because I don't know; I don't know what the price is going to be and nobody in here does; the Health Board don't know; you don't know; and we don't know; right?"

Mayor Mucci – "We don't know the level of services that we want them to provide; such as the dog bites and the things that they don't provide. Remember, the County Health Department; their expertise lies in environmental; they have Apex Landfill and all; that's where they generate most of their money and all. Their nursing divisions and public health and all is I don't want to say on a lower level than us but they don't provide it as efficiently as we do."

Mr. Mavromatis – "How can you say that?"

Mayor Mucci – “Because we; you know what, Nicole; can you explain that better than I can about the County being the environmental?”

Nicole Runco – “The stats show it; that’s why the County residents come to the City Health Department for the service because we provide better nursing and that’s why those numbers are higher. Mr. Mavromatis has been stopped on the street by a County resident asking to find the City Health Department because they wanted better service.”

Mr. Dressel – “But we don’t bill the County for that.”

Nicole Runco – “No, we don’t; and I understand what you’re saying with costs but that is why those residents keep coming back.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I get this part of it; but listen; when I go to the doctor; I’m not going to fly to New York because I know I have to pay and I don’t want to pay. Am I going to get better services in New York; I don’t know if I am or not but I come to the local doctor because I know them and they’re going to let me slide for the deductible or whatever; we can’t be; now we’re going to say we don’t want our citizens to go to the County Health Department because their nursing isn’t as good as ours; I don’t know how anybody could make that statement; how do you know that nursing division am not as good as our nursing division; I don’t understand.”

Mayor Mucci – “Those are statements we heard.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I don’t understand that part because I’m looking here and I see this Jefferson County Health Department Program; I went on their website and I got it in two seconds; that’s one of the reasons I brought up the website for the City; I couldn’t piece it together; you’d have to be Bill Gates; but they got vital statistics; birth, death certificates; genealogy; environmental; private water systems; well permits; water testing; loan; private sewage; food service license; plumbing; nuisance inspections; licenses for tattoo parlors; I don’t think we need that; investigations; dog bite investigations; you said they don’t do dog bite investigations; lead investigations; west Nile virus; landfill licensing; open dumps; TB; sexually transmitted diseases; child and family health services; immunizations; WIC programs. That is the problem; that is the real problem and I’m just going to say it; we don’t want to go to the County because we think they’re inferior; that’s why we don’t want to go, right; I mean, let’s just call it a spade.”

Dr. Macedonia – “Can I clarify something?”

Mr. Villamagna – “No, wait a minute; because we had this conversation; we think the County Health Department is inferior; that’s why we don’t want to go and I happen to disagree with that. I think the County Health Department, knowing the employees up there, going to the Board meetings I’m going to recently; I think they’re just as good as ours; I don’t know; is my doctor better than your doctor; I hope; I hope he’s the best in the world; I don’t know that though. But this is what; we’re going to back and forth with this until they’re going to get mad and they’re going to say we don’t want nothing to do with these guys. But to make that statement irritates me because I think the County Health Services offers as good as we do; that’s all I can say; and I can debate it all night long; I don’t want to.”

Mayor Mucci – “And I don’t think anybody said that they’re inferior to us; we pointed out what we heard from residents in the County and our own residents.”

Dr. Macedonia – “I just want to clarify something because I think we made an incorrect statement.”

Mr. Villamagna – “Again.”

Dr. Macedonia – “I want to clarify that we; the services that they provide are fine; when we said they don’t provide the same kind of service; that’s inaccurate. What is the difference between our health department and theirs is convenience; our staff, they’re more congenial; so there are differences but let’s be clear; it’s not about the medical care; that’s a bad thing to print or even imply; that’s not what it is. It’s more the environment; we have a much nicer department; I think you all would admit that; getting up to the floor of theirs, the parking is probably better there but they like our service better. So when people go from the County to here, there is a reason; it’s not because they don’t provide the same care; let’s be very careful about that statement because that’s inaccurate.”

Mr. Villamagna – “Well I didn’t make that statement.”

Dr. Macedonia – “I’m not looking at you; we need to erase that comment because that’s inaccurate; that’s all I’m asking.”

Mayor Mucci – “Point well taken; thank you, Dr. Macedonia.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I have to say one more thing now; the health department; I went up there, that health department needs remodeled; so I went to the County Commissioners and I asked them; what are you going to do with this health department; the roof is leaking and it am not the best place that you could possibly be. They got that HVAC that is up there now so they’re not fixing that roof until they get that corrected; once that’s corrected they’re going to replace the roof and they’re going to remodel the Health Department; so it’s going to be; now, congenial; my doctor is retired; Dr. Scurti, my man; his nurses were the most uncongenial persons that you could ever meet if you remember them; remember the two receptionists; I don’t care about the congenial part; I want to make sure that the health department services the people of the area; and I want the City to get the best bang for the dollar for everything; we went from 50,000. Trinity West and Trinity East merged; why? Why did those two merge; I went to the library; I’m not too smart but I do know what I’m saying when I say these things; they merged because the County population dropped and we can’t support two hospitals. It’s common sense and anybody that believes other than that I don’t know what to tell you; but we don’t have the population; we went from 40,000 or 35,000 or 38,000 or whatever it was; to 17,000 almost 18,000. Something has to give someplace and I’m not for raising the taxes of the citizens; I’m for trying to solve the problem; that’s what our job is to solve the problem.”

Mayor Mucci – “Another healthy discussion on the Steubenville Health Department.”

Mr. Timmons – no report
Mr. Villamagna – no report

REPORT OF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS

Mr. Mavromatis – “I will keep it very short, Mayor; I received an email from Amelia Taggart; she’s the board president of Steubenville Hilltop CDC; she asked to meet with Council and the Department Heads and as long as Council does not have an issue with this I’ll be more than happy to meet with her with our Law Director and Finance Director.”

Mr. Villamagna – “I’m sorry, Jim; did you say she wants to meet with Council?”

Mr. Mavromatis – “Yes and what she wants to go over with Council is their plans that they have and what they’d like to do; I think what has generated this is the tires; so what I’d like to do is I’ll meet with her and if she needs to have a proper briefing here then we’ll bring her in; is that fine with Council; yes; that’s it.”

Mr. Repella – no report

MISCELLANEOUS REPORTS

Mr. Villamagna – “Only one thing quick; those street signs; Lexington, West Carlton or East Carlton, I’m sorry; listen, it’s been so long since I put that request in I can’t remember the third one but it’s in there, the request is in there; I have to find out what is going on there because people are asking me. Lexington and Bryden and East Carlton and Lovers Lane and there is another one and I’ll look into it and let you know but its taking way too long for the City to address.”

Mr. Mavromatis – “Are they missing?”

Mr. Villamagna – “They’re gone; now, the one where we had a little bit of a problem on the bend there; somebody told me they saw it in a garage; I don’t know if that’s true or not. Those are the things that I get calls on right there; the signs are missing and want to know why it’s taking so long; I don’t have an answer.”

PUBLIC FORUM

Mayor Mucci – “If there is anyone wishing to speak to City Council on City business please come forward and state your name and address.”

Dr. Pat Macedonia – “I live at 109 Hiddenwood. I do want to commend Council; I don’t know why I came here so early but I’m glad I did. You need to be commended; your goals for this year are phenomenal; I hope you can accomplish half of them; if you do, you all need a feather in your cap. I’m serious. I’m so glad you brought up Efts Lane; it’s been how many years and I travel that road three or four times a day; I want to talk about the Steubenville Marina. I’m inviting all of you to look at the marina from a different perspective on my boat this summer. If you would see that marina from the river you would really appreciate the beauty; the central location. Just drive to Marietta, drive to Wellsburg, drive to Zanesville; it’s probably one of the best kept recreational secrets in town and fortunately it’s getting there by car; but getting there by boat it is a beautiful place to go; so I hope you’re up for that and again Council needs to be commended.”

Mr. Villamagna – “Pat, I want to do some fact checking with Dominic; you were a witness to something that I said I did and I want you to fact check that I was telling the truth; what did you witness me doing on Efts Lane? You stopped and said what are you doing working for the City?”

Dr. Macedonia – “I’m just kidding; he was out there with a hoe about this big filling up a pothole.”

Mayor Mucci – “If there is anyone wishing to speak to City Council on City business please come forward and state your name and address.”

Frank Calabria – “I live at 3975 Argonne. Mr. Mavromatis; did they ever do anything about the high weeds and that neighbor I have that never cuts them; he’s had three or four offenses; did they ever find out if each offense is \$225 for the last four years?”

Mr. Mavromatis – “What I was explained by the courts is they’re maxed out how high they can go; now, the thing is I went out there personally and looked at the house; I didn’t like what I saw and he kind of cleaned some of that but he only went so far in the back and if you sit there; his backyard goes all the way down to the next street; which again there are a lot of people in Steubenville that we could hold people accountable; but what I’ll do is I’ll have our enforcement guy go out tomorrow and take another look at that for you. I agree with you.”

Frank Calabria – “If you look at it; \$25 a week to pay; it’s cheaper not to cut your grass and pay the City \$200; instead of like a \$200 and \$500.”

Mr. Mavromatis – “But if he’d do it right the first time he’d be able to manage it. But you’re actually talking about what I would call woods; because the trees are high; they’re small ones but they’re tall. But I understand exactly what you’re talking about and I’ll have him go out there tomorrow.”

Mayor Mucci – “If there is anyone wishing to speak to City Council on City business please come forward and state your name and address.”

Mr. Paul moved to adjourn. Second by Mr. Villamagna. Roll call. All ayes. So moved; meeting adjourned declared Mayor Mucci.

Mary F. Anderson
Clerk of Council

ATTEST: _____
CLERK OF COUNCIL

APPROVED: _____
MAYOR